

## **BRAINTREE BOARD OF HEALTH**

### **MINUTES**

**March 11, 2010**

**IN ATTENDANCE:** Dr. Philip Nedelman, Chairman  
Paula Dowd, Vice-Chairman  
Dr. Mark Samuelson, Clerk

**ALSO PRESENT:** Marybeth McGrath, Director of ML & I

Dr. Nedelman called the meeting to order at 7:00pm.

#### **MINUTES:**

**Motion By:** Dr. Samuelson approve the minutes of February 18, 2010.  
**Second By:** Dr. Nedelman

#### **NEW BUSINESS:**

##### **1. Bill Hedlund-Consideration of Off-Leash Dog Park**

Present: Bill Hedlund, Director of Recreation and Community Events

Mr. Hedlund advised the Board that about three months ago Mayor Sullivan sent a request to the Parks and Recreation Advisory Board of the community to find a site for a suitable development of an off-leash dog park. In the months of January and February, the Board met and has welcomed dog owners to come and provide input, such as what are we looking for in an off-leash dog park.

Mr. Hedlund advised that he was unfamiliar himself, despite being a dog owner as to what it might entail for a community to entertain such. So, it is exploratory right now, the Board has considered three or four sites in town where space, parking, available water and some shade are some of the criteria that they are looking at around town, open space town property where a dog park might be suitable. During the February meeting, what came up is that they should weigh-in with the Board of Health before any recommendation is sent back to the Mayor regarding any health and safety concerns that the Board of Health might wish to recommend should a dog park be undertaken by the Town of Braintree. There are no rules or regulations at present. They have access online to dog parks, and have learned that there are numerous communities both urban and suburban in the metropolitan Boston area, as well as throughout the country where

**BRAINTREE BOARD OF HEALTH**

**MINUTES**

**March 11, 2010**

**IN ATTENDANCE:** Dr. Philip Nedelman, Chairman  
Paula Dowd, Vice-Chairman  
Dr. Mark Samuelson, Clerk

**ALSO PRESENT:** Marybeth McGrath, Director of ML & I

Dr. Nedelman called the meeting to order at 7:00pm.

**MINUTES:**

**Motion By:** Dr. Samuelson approve the minutes of February 18, 2010.  
**Second By:** Dr. Nedelman

**NEW BUSINESS:**

**1. Bill Hedlund-Consideration of Off-Leash Dog Park**

Present: Bill Hedlund, Director of Recreation and Community Events

Mr. Hedlund advised the Board that about three months ago Mayor Sullivan sent a request to the Parks and Recreation Advisory Board of the community to find a site for a suitable development of an off-leash dog park. In the months of January and February, the Board met and has welcomed dog owners to come and provide input, such as what are we looking for in an off-leash dog park.

Mr. Hedlund advised that he was unfamiliar himself, despite being a dog owner as to what it might entail for a community to entertain such. So, it is exploratory right now, the Board has considered three or four sites in town where space, parking, available water and some shade are some of the criteria that they are looking at around town, open space town property where a dog park might be suitable. During the February meeting, what came up is that they should weigh-in with the Board of Health before any recommendation is sent back to the Mayor regarding any health and safety concerns that the Board of Health might wish to recommend should a dog park be undertaken by the Town of Braintree. There are no rules or regulations at present. They have access online to dog parks, and have learned that there are numerous communities both urban and suburban in the metropolitan Boston area, as well as throughout the country where

off-leash dog parks are quite common and operated quite successfully. They have learned through visitors to the Board meetings that they are successful because dog owners have taken the responsibility to the regulations posted on the site to police their own facility. There have been issues in some communities, such as Hanson, where dog parks have been developed on conservation land that is fenced off, and there are some opponents that have legally stood up and said you cannot use conservation land for that purpose. It is being adjudicated to the point where the outcome is down the road, but not over yet. The City of Newton has four dog parks, the Town of Sharon has a successful dog park for the sixth year, the Town of Weymouth has a dog park, the Town of Hingham has a dog park, the City of Boston has several. The obvious concerns are aggressive dogs, so dog size permitted in a dog park is one item under consideration. What is under consideration right now is the larger the dog or the breed of the dog that would not be acceptable for an off-leash dog park. Any recommendations that the Board of Health may have would be packaged together with the Parks and Recreation Advisory Board's recommendations and presented to the Mayor down the road. There is no money available, but the dog park would be fenced in with a double-gate entrance, so a dog owner would enter through the first gate, close it and then enter through the second gate and close it. No children of specific age would be permitted inside the dog park at any time. Dog owners would be compelled to pick up after their dog, as they are compelled in the Town already.

Dr. Nedelman asked if it is a town regulation that dog manure be cleaned up after.

Mr. Hedlund advised that there is a pooper scooper law.

Dr. Nedelman advised that he believe that at Pond Meadow, dogs must be on a leash and the dog manure must be cleaned up after.

Mr. Hedlund advised that was correct.

Dr. Nedelman asked Mr. Hedlund if he has visited these parks in Weymouth and Hingham.

Mr. Hedlund advised that he has visited the dog park in Sharon. He has not visited others as this has all transpired during the winter months, but plans to do so and take pictures and speak with the communities to inquire about the maintenance of such a park.

Mr. Hedlund advised that the Town will mow the grass, do a weekly sweep and cleanup where owners did not see the dog defecate and therefore did not pick up after them. If the dog owners do not pickup, the Town will have to go in weekly anyway to maintain the grassy plot and will cleanup. The facility will be self-policed because the town cannot afford to staff a dog park.

Mr. Hedlund advised that the Parks and Recreation Advisory Board did explore Pond Meadow Park as a co-venture between the Towns of Weymouth and Braintree to develop

an off-leash dog park. That Board took a vote against expanding facility development within Pond Meadow Park, even for a dog park. They indicated they have enough dogs already and did not want more on the premise. Perkins Park was a second site, Adams Playground was a third site and the former Mass Respiratory Hospital property was a fourth site. No site has been favored and no vote has been taken.

Mr. Hedlund advised that he is present tonight as a voice from the Parks and Recreation Advisory Board to seek any input that the Board of Health might want to be contemplated before a proposal is to be presented to the Mayor.

Dr. Nedelman asked Mr. Hedlund if there have been any health issues with any of the other dog parks in other communities that he is aware of.

Mr. Hedlund advised that from all of the literature online, he is not aware of any health issues that have come up.

Mrs. Dowd advised that she has used the dog park at Stoddard Neck, which is on the Weymouth/Hingham line, and it is a beautiful park. The people that bring their dogs there, do clean up after them. There are dogs both on and off leashes, depending upon if the people know how friendly their dogs are. She has used it many times with her dog and has never had a problem. They have disposable dog bags and receptacles there as well.

Dr. Samuelson asked if the Town of Braintree has a dog officer, and if dogs have to be vaccinated and registered.

Mr. Hedlund advised that the town does have an animal control officer, and dogs are required to have their rabies vaccination and be registered.

**Motion By:** Mrs. Dowd to endorse a proposed off-leash dog park with the following conditions: 1) aggressive animals are banned, 2) manure is cleaned up in a timely manner by dog owners, 3) the dogs be vaccinated and licensed.

**Second By:** Dr. Samuelson  
**Unanimously Voted**

## **2. Royal Lake Village Condominium Trust-Variance of Lifeguard Provision**

Ms. McGrath advised the Board that this is a renewal of their annual lifeguard variance request. As the Board is aware, this particular location is predominantly adults and they have an extremely low bather load. Daily log sheets from previous years have indicated that it is not surprising if they have three visitors, if even that. Royal Lake Village is located off of Pond Street, and they currently have all of the required warning signs posted.

**Motion By:** Mrs. Dowd to approve the variance.

**Second By:** Dr. Samuelson  
**Unanimously Voted**

**3. Dan Clifford-Holbrook, Braintree, Randolph Civic Group**

**RE: Holbrook Transfer Station**

Present: Dan Clifford-Braintree, Randolph, Holbrook Civic Group and Councilor for District 6

Mr. Clifford advised the Board that he represents the Braintree, Randolph, Holbrook (BHR) Civic Group and Councilor for District 6. He asked if the Board has heard of the Braintree, Holbrook, Randolph Civic Group before.

Dr. Nedelman advised that he has.

Mrs. Dowd advised that she has from reviewing the website literature and information in the newspapers.

Dr. Samuelson advised that he has been on the website, but had not heard of the Civic Group until receipt of Mr. Clifford's letter.

Mr. Clifford advised the Board that the Civic Group was been formed for about a year and a half, and is made up of people from Braintree, Holbrook and Randolph. The Group's purpose is to oppose the waste transfer station that is proposed for Holbrook. They also work with the Toxic Action Group in Boston. They have legal attorneys working for them on two appeals, as Holbrook goes through their permitting process. They have an appeal pending on a Zoning Board of Appeals variance. They have about three hundred people that are part of the group now.

Mr. Clifford advised that Ms. McGrath did send some questions around the finances that the Board would like answered.

Dr. Samuelson asked what was Mr. Clifford's purpose for being here. He advised that from what he has read, this is not in Braintree, and this is the Board of Health in Braintree.

Mr. Clifford advised that both the EPA and DEP rely heavily on Boards of Health in adjacent towns for a proposed waste transfer station. So, not only will Braintree's Board of Health be asked for their expertise and their position, but also the Board of Health in Randolph, as well.

Dr. Samuelson asked who will be asking the Board that.

Mr. Clifford advised the EPA and the DEP.

Ms. McGrath advised that she was not even aware of that, and it was the first time this has come to her attention that they would be contacting the Board of Health.

Mr. Clifford advised the Board that in this particular case he is coming to the Board as councilor and as a spokesman for the BHR because of the trucks that will be coming through and the diesel pollution. If the Board has had the opportunity to get on there, then they know we are talking about diesel soot pollution causing cancer. Some of the striking things that shocked him as he was learning about this more and more, is that the diesel soot in Norfolk County compared to other counties in the country, is that we rank 272 out of 3109 counties. That is in the top 91 percentile of unhealthiest air. That is a data point, and is on the website in the main presentation. Also, a couple of other data points would be that the cancer risk from diesel soot for residents in Norfolk County is one in 3500, and that compares to the EPA's minimal of one in one million. So, that is 285 times greater. So, these are the issues and the concerns that they bring before the Board of Health because of their professionalism and expertise.

Dr. Samuelson advised that Mr. Clifford does realize that the Board of Health can only comment on how something is going to affect Braintree.

Mr. Clifford stated that there is no question about that. But, if the Board is concern about the Braintree residents, this diesel soot when you're talking another 200 trucks a day meandering their way through the town how much more that will compound the already unhealthy air that we have.

Dr. Samuelson asked that maybe we could just stick to Braintree, so there are going to be 200 trucks going where through Braintree?

Mr. Clifford advised approximately 200 trucks a day, coming through all sides. Primarily, they will be getting off at the South Shore Plaza on Granite Street, following Granite Street all the way up to Franklin Street, down to Washington Street and up to South Street. South Street is a 100% residential neighborhood. It would be like going through your neighborhood.

Dr. Nedelman asked why wouldn't they just go straight up Granite Street.

Mr. Clifford advised that they could go up Granite Street and go down Pond Street, as well. What would be the determining factor would be the traffic conditions at Five Corners.

Mrs. Dowd advised that what she has read has them mostly coming off in Randolph and going up the main road of Randolph and not coming through Braintree as much.

Mr. Clifford stated well when you say as much.

Mrs. Dowd advised they are talking an average three per hour on Washington Street to South Street.

Mr. Clifford asked who said that.

Mrs. Dowd advised the Holbrook Transfer Station Community Outreach website.

Mr. Clifford said yes, obviously that is from the Holbrook one.

Mrs. Dowd said it is in Holbrook, and she is trying to research all of the facts, his site, and the Holbrook site.

Mr. Clifford advised that what the BHR site says is that we will see 50% of those trucks coming across. 50% of 200 is 100 trucks a day, so you are talking about from 6am to 5pm.

Dr. Samuelson advised that Mr. Clifford just went from 200 to 100 trucks a day.

Mr. Clifford advised through Braintree.

Dr. Samuelson advised that is what we are concerned with, unless the Board wants to expand that.

Mrs. Dowd advised that she brought up Randolph because that is what she read that the majority would get off in Randolph and go through Randolph.

Mr. Clifford said when you say the majority, you are cutting a fine line. You are talking a difference between maybe 53 or 54% versus 48% or 46%.

Dr. Nedelman advised that Mr. Clifford is throwing some numbers around and using those numbers as facts. Mr. Clifford referred to 200 trucks a day. Now according to the website, the Holbrook Transfer Station is going to be licensed to hold 1000 tons a day. According to the information that Dr. Nedelman has, an 18 wheeler can hold an average of 27 ton.

Mr. Clifford said that most of them will not be 18 wheelers.

Dr. Nedelman advised that a garbage truck can hold 8 to 18 ton, figure 15. That is 66 trucks. If they are 18 wheelers, they are down to 40 trucks. So, split the difference and call it 50 trucks, 55 trucks. That is quite a change from 200.

Dr. Samuelson advised that of the 50, half of them are going through Randolph, so that is only 25 trucks.

Dr. Nedelman advised that is correct. He also advised that from the MA Department of Public Health (MDPH) regarding Braintree, and it talks about lung cancer deaths. The concentration of diesel in the air quality is quite different if you go into the Blue Hills Observatory and testing. We have a one of the cleaner sites throughout the country, and certainly not anywhere near what Mr. Clifford is suggesting. In Braintree the area count for lung cancer, in the year 2000 was 30 cancer deaths with an area age adjusted of 61.9

and the state was 50.8. So, we were higher. When it comes to asthma, the area count was 45, with the area age adjusted 122.6, the state adjusted was 146.9. So, Braintree had less asthma than the state in general. This was off the MDPH website. So, Dr. Nedelman questions: 1) the number of trucks, 2) the statements that Mr. Clifford is making regarding the air quality. They just do not jive.

Dr. Nedelman read documentation that had to do with asthma in Massachusetts in 2006 and 2007 for every school in Massachusetts. He advised that of 14 educational facilities in Braintree, 12 of them are not statistically significant from the rest of the state. Two were higher and those two are Liberty School and East Middle School, which are north and south of the town, polar opposites. He advised he thinks we all learned long ago that you can do anything with numbers and can play games with statistics, but these are the things that he has looked up. The Board's issue is really the health concern and he is questioning some of the numbers that Mr. Clifford is using as factual because he does not see that number.

Mr. Clifford presented documentation to the Board on the radius and the routes that would be going through Randolph primarily and Braintree. The reason why that is is that they gave a presentation to Randolph.

Dr. Nedelman asked are we assuming that there is going to be an increase in tonnage in the decades to come, or with conservation and recycling is there going to be a decrease in tonnage.

Mr. Clifford advised the Board that in questioning the statistics, that they come from the EPA. So, these are not the BHR numbers at all. They can go out to the EPA and show where they come from, and on the website all of the information and data has been sources.

Dr. Samuelson advised that numbers like that granted are real. That is the numerator, the denominator is the population. So, we should not compare the northeast to Dakota, and that is what those numbers do.

Mr. Clifford said this is Norfolk County.

Dr. Samuelson advised compared to what. In other words, we live in a very populated area. We make a lot of trash. We have a lot of diesel stuff. So, we should be in the higher percentile, that should be based on population and it is not. In other words, we are at the top. I would expect that, as the northeast is one of the most populated parts in the country. So, data like that although true, you have to adjust it for the population. He would expect that we would have more emissions here because we have a lot of people here, cars, traffic and pollution. He does not think that is saying that we are outliers. If you adjust that for population, we are probably in the same ballpark as any densely populated suburban part of the country.

Mr. Clifford advised that he would like to recalibrate this a bit. In his opinion, the Board members are the experts in terms of what health issues would burden Braintree's residents as a result of this. The BHR's purpose is to bring it to the foreground, so that the Board's expertise can take a look at it and come back to the BHR and tell them what the Board's professional opinion is based on the data that they can gather. The BHR has provided some places like the Toxic Action Committee. If there are other sites that the Board is aware of by all means go there. He advised that he is really relying upon the professionals here. He is certainly not a doctor, but he has been involved in this for enough time to recognize, and there was a major accident in New Bedford only last year and it was in a far less populated location than what is proposed here in Holbrook.

Mrs. Dowd advised that we have had a transfer station here in Braintree and we haven't had, thank god, any catastrophes like this.

Mr. Clifford advised he has no control over what has happened here in Braintree and what has been here in Braintree, but we still do have some control with a waste transfer station that would be abutting us.

Dr. Nedelman said wait a minute you are a councilor, you are an elected official in Braintree, what do you mean you have no control over what is going on over on Ivory Street.

Mr. Clifford advised that what he is saying is that that transfer station has been there for some fifty years now, and the lease is up in several years.

Dr. Nedelman asked what several is?

Mr. Clifford advised he does not know exactly, several years.

Dr. Nedelman advised that he wanted to go back to his question about whether the population in general is going to increase tonnage of refuse or decrease, with recycling.

Mr. Clifford advised that he said he was going to give the Board some facts on that. In Braintree, which is a 1200 ton a day transfer station, we have an average of 168 trucks that go through there a day. 168 in and 168 out. Three years ago before the recession started, the Town was collecting tipping fees to the tune of \$ 850,000.00. Last year, the tipping fees were \$ 425,000.00. It is half. So, your question is self evident. Right now, there is less.

Dr. Nedelman said okay. If there is less, and Holbrook goes ahead with its transfer station then it is going to pull business away from Braintree.

Mr. Clifford said that is a jump.

Dr. Nedelman said, Mr. Clifford just said that the quantity, the tonnage is going down.

Mr. Clifford advised that it is going down because we are in recessionary times and because everything is going down.

Dr. Nedelman said garbage is garbage.

Mrs. Dowd advised that she thinks it is because people are recycling more than they ever did.

Dr. Nedelman agreed.

Mr. Clifford advised that there are more people laid off. Let's face it there is 20% of the people that are not working now.

Dr. Nedelman advised that it is his opinion that total tonnage is at least plateauing, if not going down because people are recycling more. But, the issue is where these trucks are coming from. Where do the trucks that go to Braintree now come from and will Braintree loose business.

Mr. Clifford advised whether Braintree loses business or not is irrelevant to the discussion. His opinion is probably not because Braintree will start a bidding war., and that will be the executive office that makes those decisions. Currently, Weymouth, Quincy and Boston is primarily where the trucks come from. Holbrook will have it regional, so they can come in from anywhere in the country, anywhere in New England.

Dr. Samuelson stated that Holbrook would take Holbrook's trash, he would assume.

Dr. Nedelman advised yes.

Mr. Clifford advised that Holbrook does not have trash pickup today. They use vendors.

Dr. Nedelman advised that is one of the reasons that the referendum passed in Holbrook that the agreement is that residents will now have trash pickup free of charge.

Mr. Clifford advised that is correct

Dr. Nedelman advised that the question is why is Holbrook in favor of it, and they are talking in one article about making 30 million dollars off of it and getting free trash pickup.

Mr. Clifford advised let's take a look at those numbers. If you compare those to what Braintree's numbers are \$ 425,000.00, and a 1200 tons a day. How is a 1000 tons a day going to do \$ 580,000.00? So, you have to take a look at numbers and reconcile them to what is really happening.

Dr. Samuelson said so we do 1200 tons a day here.

Mr. Clifford advised that is what the capacity is. It is under capacity, just as in Norfolk County there are 72 waste transfer stations. The clear majority of them are under capacity.

Dr. Samuelson said so maybe guessing, we are 1000 tons a day in Braintree. He advised that Holbrook would be similar in capacity.

Mr. Clifford advised that Holbrook would be 16% less.

Mrs. Dowd advised that on March 9, 2010, 151 trucks visited the Braintree Transfer Station for a total of 1100 tons.

Dr. Samuelson asked if it would be safe to say that once Holbrook gets up and running that it would be taking trash from Holbrook, from Randolph and probably some surrounding communities.

Mr. Clifford advised not just surrounding communities, but outside the state.

Dr. Samuelson advised that what he was getting at is that Holbrook has to do something with its trash.

Dr. Nedelman asked what Holbrook does now.

Mr. Clifford advised that they have independent trash pickup.

Dr. Samuelson asked where it goes.

Mr. Clifford advised that he did not know. It does not go here, it may go to Ohio.

Ms. McGrath advised that the trash pickup in Holbrook is a contract that the town has with a company that comes and picks up garbage and trash. You also have to buy bags that you put the trash in. If you do not have the trash in the Holbrook bags, it will not be picked up. They pickup recycling items, but do not pickup yard waste, bulk items, appliances, construction materials, furniture. A resident can also choose to have an independent vendor.

Dr. Samuelson advised that Braintree makes \$ 425,000.00 a year, but also has to pay a company to pick up trash.

Ms. McGrath advised that Braintree, Weymouth and Quincy are in a tri-town system picked up by Capital Waste.

Dr. Samuelson advised that what he is getting at is that we all have to do something with our trash and if we all just put it out and let it build up that is a public health nuisance. So, in one way of looking at this it is good to get trash picked up and taken away. That is where we have to start. So, Holbrook has to take care of their own trash.

Mr. Clifford advised that with all due respect, what he really looking for is the Board of Health to provide their expertise and opinion on the health issues around this.

Dr. Samuelson advised that is his point. If people do not pick up their trash in Holbrook, if there is no trash pickup, then what are people going to do with it.

Mr. Clifford advised that they pick it up today.

Dr. Samuelson advised that he is saying that part of the purpose of this transfer station is to take the trash from Holbrook.

Mr. Clifford advised that there are alternatives.

Dr. Samuelson advised that this is what they are going to do. When this is up and running, if it is up and running, they are going to take trash from Holbrook and bring it to one site, pack it up and put it on a train.

Mr. Clifford advised that is a whole different set of issues around that.

Dr. Samuelson advised and get it out of here. So, that to him from a public health standpoint is not a bad thing, it is a good thing. In other words, the alternative is to just put trash out on your front lawn. So, from a public health standpoint trash pickup is important. He wanted that acknowledged that someone has to pick up your trash and do something with it from a public health standpoint.

Mr. Clifford said sure. He also advised that Holbrook has the opportunity to have Braintree pick it up.

Dr. Samuelson advised that is irrelevant.

Mr. Clifford advised he is just saying there are alternatives.

Dr. Samuelson advised there are no alternatives to picking up trash, someone has to pick it up. People in Holbrook make trash. If a service does not take it away, it is a public health nuisance.

Mr. Clifford advised that he did not know what Dr. Samuelson's point was, it gets taken away today.

Mrs. Dowd advised that we are talking about public health issues, and we have a transfer station in our own town. She has a hard time saying it is going to be bad for the people on Washington Street and South Street, and say it is not bad for the people on Pearl Street and Ivory Street and the surrounding neighborhoods there. You cannot say it is bad for you, but not for you.

Mr. Clifford advised that is her mission to come out with a statement on public health.

Mrs. Dowd advised that she cannot say that it is bad for Washington Street and South Street because these same diesel fumes are all over town. We have school buses everyday driving diesel. There are diesel trucks, FedEx trucks that are diesel. Everybody is diesel. They are coming through town all day long. We have our own trash trucks all day long going through the town. She does not see how the Board can say it is a health risk for Washington/South Street and it is not a health risk for the people in Braintree.

Mr. Clifford advised that no one ever said that.

Mrs. Dowd advised that is what she has been reading on the website, how offal it is going to be for the people on South Street.

Mr. Clifford advised that incrementally it will be terrible. Can you imagine 100 trucks going down your street a day?

Dr. Samuelson advised that he has to talk real numbers or the Board would not be going any further.

Mr. Clifford advised okay let's talk real numbers. If you take that 100 tons a day and divide it by 20 tons per truck, what does that come out to, 100 trucks.

Dr. Nedelman advised that they are not all going down South Street.

Dr. Samuelson advised it is 50.

Mr. Clifford advised 50 down and 50 back.

Dr. Nedelman advised fine, we will accept that, but they are not all going down South Street.

Dr. Samuelson advised they are not all coming down through Braintree.

Dr. Nedelman advised per the Randolph map, a lot of them are coming from that direction and if any of them approach Braintree Transfer Station, why would they go to all the way to Holbrook instead of dropping off on Ivory Street.

Mr. Clifford advised that they would be contracted to them.

Dr. Nedelman advised there is going to be a price war.

Mr. Clifford advised that he fails to understand what that has to do with health.

Dr. Nedelman advised only based on this: Mr. Clifford is making his assumption on the number of trucks that are driving down South Street and there is absolutely no factual basis at all to that number because he is taking a total number that you have to spread out

over the entire area west of Braintree coming from 128, coming from Randolph, coming from Stoughton and funneling them all through Five Corners up Franklin Street up Washington and down South Street and that is not the case.

Mr. Clifford advised it is not the case.

Dr. Nedelman asked what percentage of the trucks that might go to Holbrook would go down Washington to South Street? Could Mr. Clifford give him that estimate, in his opinion?

Mr. Clifford advised that he could not tell Dr. Nedelman that.

Dr. Nedelman said you don't have an educated guess knowing the route, knowing where the trucks are coming from.

Mr. Clifford advised that you do not know where the trucks are coming from. They are coming off of 128, they are coming off of Route 24. Those are the ones that are primarily going to be going through Randolph.

Dr. Nedelman asked why should they all go to the western most route, Franklin Street to Washington to South, when they can go straight up Granite Street to Randolph and hook over to Holbrook.

Mr. Clifford advised that maybe some of them would.

Dr. Nedelman asked his question again, in Mr. Clifford's opinion what percentage of the total number of trucks going to Holbrook would be going down South Street.

Mr. Clifford advised that their assumption was based on 200 trucks total.

Dr. Nedelman advised that is total and the 200 is argumentative. That is a high number.

Mr. Clifford said lets go back to the numbers now. We have an average of 168 going to Braintree and it is under capacity and that is 1200.

Dr. Nedelman advised that Holbrook is going to be less, so it has got to be less than 168.

Mr. Clifford advised Holbrook is less, but it is not 40.

Dr. Nedelman and Dr. Samuelson advised that it is not 200.

Mr. Clifford advised that number divide in half because we are assuming that half would come through Braintree and half would go through Randolph.

Dr. Nedelman advised that the total number may be 125.

Mr. Clifford advised how do we know? We don't know that is why it is an assumption.

Mrs. Dowd advised that she thinks that is a high assumption because she thinks most if they are coming from Route 24 they are going to get off in Randolph. If they are coming down 128, they are going to get off in Randolph. If they are coming from the south, they are going to Braintree, they are not going to go all the way to Holbrook.

Mr. Clifford advised that it would depend on the contract.

Dr. Nedelman again asked what the percentage is of the total number of trucks going down Washington and South Street.

Mr. Clifford advised in the absence of data that you have to make assumptions. The assumption was 50%. 50% would go through Braintree, 50% would go through Randolph.

Dr. Nedelman asked when they go through Braintree does that automatically mean Washington Street to South.

Mr. Clifford advised it could be Granite Street to Pond and through Randolph to Holbrook.

Dr. Nedelman advised that is out of 50%, so let's knock it down to 30% that go down Washington Street to South.

Mr. Clifford advised it is all in the same area.

Dr. Samuelson advised that we are never going to reach an agreement here. That is part of the problem, we look on the Holbrook website it is completely different from the BHR website. No one here is independent.

Mr. Clifford advised that so is the idea, if there is something here and there is something there, then the truth is probably somewhere in the middle. Can we agree on that?

Dr. Nedelman advised we agree.

Dr. Samuelson advised so let's say 50 trucks will go to and from, so 100. So, let's say we accept that. Now, the next step in order for the Board to consider this as a public health risk, the Board would need some data from an independent source that says that is going to have some sort of a health risk. We are not going to base it on biased information, which the BHR website has.

Dr. Samuelson advised that Mr. Clifford came to the Board seeking an opinion, Dr. Samuelson's opinion, he will not give the opinion of the Board, is that his recommendation is to Mr. Clifford and his group, to get an independent scientific review of just that issue of the trucks traveling/the diesel output health risks. That should be

presented to the Board of Health in Holbrook, in Randolph and to the Braintree Board of Health. We cannot make an educated decision.

Dr. Nedelman advised that we have that information now, but the question is will adding those trucks significantly affect it. He advised that Mr. Clifford keeps focusing on pulmonary. We have the asthma and lung cancer.

Mr. Clifford advised that there is also the noise and if you take a look at the data, the diesel soot.

Dr. Nedelman asked how many vehicles travel up and down Washington Street now a day?

Mr. Clifford advised that he did not know, you would have to do a traffic count.

Dr. Nedelman advised that he knows, 21,000 vehicles a day. Studies have been done. The question is what percentage of them are trucks. He does not know.

Mrs. Dowd advised what about school buses, anything that is diesel you would have to factor in.

Dr. Nedelman advised the question is of the 21,000, how many are trucks, how many are diesel and throwing in another 50, if those 50 are going down Washington Street to South what significance is that going to make.

Dr. Samuelson advised that we cannot answer, he is not an expert. You would need someone that is independent that does not have a vested interest in Braintree, Randolph or Holbrook.

Dr. Nedelman advised that if Mr. Clifford's question is can the Board support his claims and endorse the opposition to Holbrook, would the Board?

Mr. Clifford advised before the Board gets there, he is a little bit dumbfounded. His purpose for being here is to talk to the experts, the doctor's and the nurses. He does not know how severe this is. Their question is that they need the Board's help to tell them how severe this is.

Dr. Samuelson advised that he just gave Mr. Clifford a recommendation. Mr. Clifford is asking a scientist a question. Mr. Clifford is asking for an opinion, and Dr. Samuelson cannot give him a legitimate opinion because he does not have any data. He has biased data that means nothing to Dr. Samuelson. Dr. Samuelson again recommended getting an independent scientific review. Dr. Samuelson advised from a scientific point of view, if Mr. Clifford wants to move this along that is what he is going to have to do. Dr. Samuelson does not make decisions based on biased information. He cannot, it is public health we are talking about.

Mr. Clifford advised he understands that. But, wanted the Board to know that the Braintree Town Council, the Randolph Town Council, the Braintree School Committee, Mayor Sullivan, Senator Joyce, Representative Timilty have all come out against this.

Mrs. Dowd wanted to know what factual information did they have. She has what the school committee voted on. In the article, she feels there were very misleading quotes made.

Mr. Clifford advised that his point is that it seems there is a lot of opposition to this. Because this is going to come before the Holbrook Board of Health, Braintree and Randolph will be asked to participate in one form or another from the DEP or the EPA to give their opinion of it. He is simply here to say that is going to happen. The Board of Health has asked him to go do something else, but that does not change the fact. Maybe we can afford that, we will take a look at that and maybe we cannot afford it, we are in appeals now. He thinks it is incumbent upon the Braintree Board of Health to take a look themselves on what this might mean with regard to the health and safety issues that could affect the residents of Braintree.

Dr. Samuelson advised that the Board is not taking this lightly.

Mr. Clifford said that it sounded like it was being thrown back at him.

Dr. Samuelson advised that it is, in this respect. He is asking for a scientific opinion, and he has three of them, and Dr. Samuelson's recommendation is that there is not enough unbiased information for them to make a legitimate decision. He is not throwing it back at Mr. Clifford, but Dr. Samuelson is saying that Mr. Clifford asked and he is giving him an answer. Dr. Samuelson advised that the easiest way to do that, although he does not know who will pay for it, is to get an independent scientific review of the one point that Mr. Clifford wants to prove or disprove, which is "x" number of trucks are going to cause a health concern. That is an easy thing, and if you walk away from this meeting with that and follow through with that, you will get a lot of mileage from any Board of Health because that is what Boards of Health listen to. The Holbrook Board of Health is an elected board and he is sure they are quite savvy and up for the challenge, but they are also going to want objective information. This is not a political board, this is an objective board who want objective information to make decisions on.

Mr. Clifford advised that he could not agree with Dr. Samuelson more. He is not a doctor. He is asking the doctor's for their professional opinion.

Dr. Samuelson said is this going around in circles. He just gave Mr. Clifford his professional opinion.

Mr. Clifford advised that Dr. Samuelson said go seek other information.

Dr. Samuelson advised that he said he cannot speak for his colleagues, but that he cannot make an objective, legitimate, scientific decision on what he has seen. He could if

someone that was objective did an independent review and presented to the board a scientific study of the issue.

Mr. Clifford advised that he is simply saying that they need the Board's help.

Mrs. Dowd advised based on the data from the Department of Public Health, the Board cannot say that 50 or 100 trucks will make a huge difference or not.

Mr. Clifford advised that if this Board came out and said look it, it is negligible then fine that is all they care about. They are just looking for an opinion from the Board of Health that is all.

Dr. Nedelman advised that what Dr. Samuelson is saying that the Board cannot give Mr. Clifford one.

Dr. Samuelson advised that the way science works is you weigh things, it is an objective science, you look at data.

Mr. Clifford advised Dr. Samuelson not to speak down to him.

Dr. Samuelson advised that he is not, but Mr. Clifford does not seem to understand what he is saying. Mr. Clifford keeps going back to you came here for an opinion.

Mr. Clifford advised that he understands exactly what Dr. Samuelson is saying. Further, that he does not expect that an opinion coming out of here tonight. He is here, and has provided the Board with some information. The Board has other information from other sources. So, he is saying to the Board as the experts, take that, analyze it and provide back to the Town the Board's opinion.

Dr. Nedelman advised that as experts, we do not have the information to either endorse or not endorse the situation without further information.

Dr. Samuelson advised further information from an objective person. Mr. Clifford has given numbers that are all over the place.

Mr. Clifford advised with all due respect, these numbers have come from the DEP and the EPA.

Dr. Samuelson advised that we cannot even agree on the number of trucks that are going down the street.

Mr. Clifford advised that we can based on assumptions. In the absence of data, you have to have a set of assumptions. When you have 1000 tons a day, you say how much is the average truck going to be and they said 20 tons, and that is how they came up with 100 trucks. We have a 1200 ton a day industry in Braintree and that is averaging 168 day, so the numbers are not that far off.

Dr. Nedelman advised if it is 20 tons a truck and it is a 1000 a day, then that is 50 trucks.

Mr. Clifford advised that what they are saying is that there is going to be 2 million pounds of trash a day running up and down the streets, so we simply divided the 2 million by the 20,000.

Mrs. Dowd advised that they all would not be coming through Braintree.

Mr. Clifford advised absolutely not all coming from Braintree. Remember this is not only a Braintree problem, but also a Randolph and Holbrook issue. So, those 100 trucks in and 100 trucks out are somehow going to be dispersed through Braintree and through Randolph for the most part. The traffic studies have shown by TLC's own people that the majority of traffic is going to shoot up Centre Street or shoot up North Main Street. They are not going to go through Holbrook. That is a traffic study that is in place.

Dr. Nedelman asked if any other Board of Health have given him an endorsement.

Ms. McGrath advised that she does not believe that the Holbrook Board of Health has heard this matter yet.

Mr. Clifford advised that they have not, and he made it clear in his letter to the Board that sometime over the next 60 days they will be having a Board of Health hearing in Holbrook.

Dr. Nedelman asked if there was a Zoning Board meeting in Holbrook on Tuesday?

Ms. McGrath advised that she thought it was Planning.

Dr. Nedelman asked what the results of that were.

Ms. McGrath advised that she believed it was continued.

Mr. Clifford advised that they have been to zoning and are into conservation and planning.

Dr. Samuelson advised Mr. Clifford that clearly in his letter he wrote that he would like to be able to include the Braintree Board of Health in our list opposing the Holbrook Regional Waste Transfer Station.

Mr. Clifford advised sure.

Dr. Samuelson advised so Mr. Clifford did not come here objectively and present data. Seriously, he wrote it and he wants the Board to say it is a bad thing.

Mr. Clifford advised the Board that he wanted to recalculate that. Sometimes words are written. He advised that his opinion that he wanted to make clear was that he has come here because the Board is the experts, he is not. The Board of Health in Holbrook does not have doctors on it. The Board of Health in Randolph has a doctor on it. So, it looked to him like Braintree is way ahead of the game and if they could get a professional opinion from them then that is the right thing.

Mrs. Dowd advised that she cannot imagine that Holbrook or Randolph would not be asking for the same information that the Braintree Board of Health is.

Dr. Samuelson advised that any board of health is going to ask what Braintree has asked Mr. Clifford for.

Mr. Clifford advised that he cannot speak for Randolph, but he does know that the Randolph Town Council is going to be going through the same iterations.

Dr. Nedelman advised that if he wants to look at the Board as experts in any way it is because their expertise is perhaps in looking at studies, statistics and epidemiological report, such as from MDPH, effects on schools and things like that. That is what the Board has in front of them, and what he has seen does not allow him to say he supports what Mr. Clifford is doing because there is no scientific basis to make to claims that he is making. That is the bottom line.

Mr. Clifford advised that he is not making any claims. His observations that he has made in his research looking to the DEP and the EPA, and the work and direction that the Boston Toxic Action Center has provided leads us to these kinds of data points. If there are other data points, then he will be glad to look at them.

Dr. Nedelman advised that he has given them to him.

Mr. Clifford advised that he does not have them.

Dr. Nedelman provided Mr. Clifford with the MDPH data that he has. Dr. Nedelman further advised that he probably already had the print out of all of the transfer stations.

Mr. Clifford advised that he did. All 72 of them in Norfolk County. It is the highest density of waste transfer stations.

Dr. Nedelman asked who were the two largest capacity in the state.

Mr. Clifford advised that he did not dig that deep.

Dr. Nedelman advised Boston and Braintree. 292,000 ton and 295,000 ton in Boston. Now, Holbrook is talking about a tonnage similar to Braintree. If tonnage is not going to increase then there have to be price wars.

Mrs. Dowd advised that we have to remember that we are talking about health and we have a transfer station, so it is very difficult to say that it is a bad thing. What will the residents of Braintree say, if we came out and endorse that it is going to be a bad thing to have these trucks going down Washington Street. We think that we will have the Ivory Street people down here the next day screaming.

Mr. Clifford advised that honestly he understands what Ms. Dowd is saying. His question to the Board is what will the incremental difference be in terms of health.

The Board collectively reply that they do not know.

Dr. Nedelman advised that we cannot answer that question, which is the whole point in what Dr. Samuelson was trying to say to him.

Dr. Samuelson advised that he means no disrespect at all, but honestly Mr. Clifford is asking the Board to do something that we cannot do, at least he cannot do.

Mr. Clifford advised that this is the first time he has come before the Board and his intention here is to advise and to look for feedback.

Dr. Nedelman said he had hoped they were advising him.

Mr. Clifford advised that he is really looking to the Board of Health for support here one way or another.

Dr. Samuelson advised that he can repeat his recommendation.

Mr. Clifford advised that he will do his best with that, but there are other things that can be done as well, by the Board researching on their own.

Dr. Samuelson said wait a minute are you going to pay me to research this for you.

Mr. Clifford advised that aren't we all here for service to our town.

Mrs. Dowd advised that the Board members all did a lot research this matter.

Dr. Samuelson advised that he is not an expert in environmental health, he is physician with a scientific background. He would rather listen to someone who does this day in and day out and is objective and gives us the data.

Dr. Nedelman advised the Board is looking for objectivity and the Board has said all they can say. This has been very interesting and informational, but the Board will take no action on it.

Mr. Clifford advised that this is a courtesy visit.

Dr. Nedelman advised that the Board appreciates Mr. Clifford taking the time to come before the Board.

Dr. Samuelson advised that if Mr. Clifford does come back before the Board to present this similar issue that he will not have open ears unless he has some information that was talked about.

Mr. Clifford advised that he has plenty on his plate and does not think that the Board will find him back before the Board again. He will do his best to get the data.

**INFORMATIONAL:**

**4. American Medical News-Electronic Cigarettes**

Dr. Nedelman advised the Board that they have a two page magazine article from the AMA on electronic cigarettes.

**MATTERS BY THE BOARD:**

**5. Request for Approval- Letter on Outdoor Recreational Activities and the Risk of Mosquito-Borne Diseases**

Ms. McGrath advised the Board that this is the annual letter that she sends on behalf of the Board to the schools and all of the sports and youth activities as a reminder to consider curtailing activities when mosquitoes are most active and to take precautions against exposure to mosquitoes.

**Motion By:** Mrs. Dowd to approve preparing and sending the letter.  
**Second By:** Dr. Samuelson  
**Unanimously Voted**

**Motion By:** Mrs. Dowd to adjourn the meeting at 8:10 pm.  
**Second By:** Dr. Samuelson